

Opinions expressed here are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Empire State Stem Cell Board, the New York State Department of Health, or the State of New York.

Stakeholders Chart and Brief Biographies of Characters for Role-play
Learning Activity 3: Eggs & Blood: Gifts & Commodities
by Katayoun Chamany & Alexa Riggs Updated July 2018

Character/Stakeholders Possible Connections Chart

Name	Expertise & Practice	Affiliation	Possible Allies/Opponents	Buzzwords for Resources
1. Jennifer Lahl	Health Activist & Nurse	Director, Center for Bioethics and Culture, Co-producer of <i>Eggsploitation</i> film; FCLNY lawsuit; Founding Member of Hands Off Our Ovaries	Shares values with: 3,11,12,18 Values conflict with: 4,5,9,14	FEMINIST ACTIVISM HEALTH RISK
2. Father Thomas Berg	Theologian and Ethicist	Professor of Moral Philosophy, St. Joseph's Seminary; Former member of the NYSTEM Ethics Committee	Shares values with: 11,18 Values conflict with: 4,5,9, 14	ETHICS HEALTH RISK
3. Calla Papademas	Reproductive Oocyte Provider	Student/Alumna, Stanford University	Shares values with: 1,12, 20 Values conflict with: 4,5,14,17, 19	CHOICE HEALTH RISK
4. Robert Klitzman	Psychiatrist & Bioethicist	NYSTEM Ethics Committee Member, Faculty at Columbia University	Shares values with: 5,9,14,19 Values conflict with: 1,2,6,7,8, 20	CHOICE COMPENSATION
5. Brooke Ellison	Policy Scholar & Person Living with Disabilities	NYSTEM Ethics Committee Member; co-author of the American Journal of Bioethics paper on assessing risk of OHSS; Director of Education and Ethics at the Stony Brook University Stem Cell Research Facility Center	Shares values with: 4,9,14,19 Values conflict with: 1,2,6,7,8,13,20	CHOICE COMPENSATION HEALTH RISK
6. Lisa Ikemoto	Law & Social Justice Scholar	Law Professor UC Davis, Center for Genetics and Society; Globalized Markets	Shares values with: 7,10, 11,19 Values conflict with: 4,5,9,15,20	BODILY GOODS CAPITALISM FEMINIST ACTIVISM
7. Ruha Benjamin	Race & Justice; Sociologist Scholar	Assistant Professor of Sociology and African American Studies, Boston University	Shares values with: 8,9,11,13,19 Values conflict with: 4,5,15,20	CHOICE ETHICS FEMINIST ACTIVISM

8. Erica Haimes	Sociologist/ Emerging Technologies Scholar	Professor of Sociology and Executive Director of Policy, Ethics, And Life Sciences Institute Newcastle University; ISSCR Position Statement	Shares values with: 4,6,9,19 Values conflict with: 12, 20	BODILY GOODS CHOICE HEALTH RISKS
9. Charis Thompson	Gender & Science Scholar	Chair of Women and Gender Studies UC Berkeley	Shares values with: 1,4,7,10,19, Values conflict with: 6,20	CHOICE/EQUITY COMPENSATION ETHICS
10. Michal Nahman	Feminist Sociologist Scholar	Professor of Sociology, University of the West of England; Globalized Markets	Shares values with: 6,7,9,19 Values conflict with: 3, 20	CAPITALISM CHOICE RISK
11. Seema Mohapatra	Public Health Law Scholar	Professor of Law Barry University	Shares values with: 7,8,9,18 Values conflict with: 3,20	BODILY GOODS COMPENSATION
12. Womenlink Representative or SAMA Representative or Hands off Our Ovaries Representative or Repokult Representative	Feminist Activist Group	Womenlink South Korea: Hee SAMA: promotes women's health in South Asia *surrogacy HOOO: Beeson, Sociologist Reprokult: Schneider	Shares values with: 1,3,6,7,10,19 Values conflict with: 3,4,5,14,17,20	CAPITALISM FEMINIST ACTIVISM
13. Patty Berne	Social Justice Activist	LGBTQI, Race, and Disability Scholar; Director of Sins Invalid	Shares values with: 7,8,11 Values conflict with: 4,5, 20	CHOICE ETHICS
14. Kevin Eggan OR Dieter Egli	Stem Cell Scientist	Chief Scientific Officer New York Stem Cell Foundation/ Research Scientist identifying egg reprogramming factors	Shares values with: 4,5,9,15 Values conflict with: 1,2,7,12, 20	BIOLOGY COMPENSATION
15. Doris C. Woods OR Jonathan Tilly	Scientist/ Ovarian Stem Cells	Vincent Center for Reproductive Biology, Mass General Hospital	Shares values with: 4,5,14, Values conflict with: 2,8	BIOLOGY CAPITAL COMPENSATION
16. Robin Lovell-Badge	Stem Cell Scientist	Director of Stem Cell Biology and Developmental Genetics group at the MRC National Institute for Medical Research in London and challenges Jonathon Tilly's claim of ovarian stem cells	Shares values with: 4,5,14 Values conflict with: 15, 5	BIOLOGY

17. ASRM Ethics	Professional Society	The American Society for Reproductive Medicine has an Ethics Committee that has published two reports: the first regarding the use of ART and egg freezing for LGBTQI and single women, and the second regarding the use of extranumerary embryos for stem cell research	Shares values with: 15,19 Values conflict with: 12	BODILY GOODS CHOICE COMPENSATION
18. Chelsea Briganti	Designer & Parsons Alumna	Designed a project to address public menstrual stem cell banks called Mademoicell.	Shares values with: 3,7,8,11,20 Values conflict with: 15	BODILY GOODS CAPITALISM CHOICE
19. Gabriele Werner-Felmayer	Scientist/Bioethicist	Innsbruck Medical University; International Network of the UNESCO Chair in Bioethics (Austria); Globalized Markets	Shares values with: 1,6,7,9,10 Values conflict with: 3,20	CAPITALISM CHOICE ETHICS HEALTH RISK
20. Françoise Shenfield	Fertility Specialist	University College London Hospitals, European Taskforce for Ethics and Law	Shares values with: 10, 4 Values conflict with: 6,19	COMPENSATION
21. Michelle Goodwin	Health Law and Social Justice	Chancellor's Professor of Law at UC Irvine, Board of Directors for the ACLU	Shares values with: 4,5,10,19 Values conflict with: 3,20	BODILY GOODS COMPENSATION

1. Jennifer Lahl (Feminist Activist)

Jennifer Lahl is the president of The Center for Bioethics and Culture Network, a non-profit organization that seeks to advance morally responsible science by protecting human life and dignity. She has worked in the field for 25 years as a pediatric critical care nurse, hospital administrator, and in senior-level nursing management. Lahl has produced *Lines That Divide: The Great Stem Cell Debate* and has produced, directed, and written *Eggsploitation*, and *Anonymous Father's Day*. Lahl is an advocate for highlighting the risks of fertility drugs involved with egg “donation” and the people conceived via donors. In the Feminist Choosing Life New York State lawsuit against the State Health Department’s payment-for-eggs program Lahl produced an affidavit claiming that the program unfairly entices economically vulnerable women. As a field expert, she is regularly interviewed in the media to speak with lawmakers and members of the scientific community. She is also a founding member and participant of *Hands Off Our Ovaries* a pro-life and pro-choice feminist organization calling for a moratorium on egg extraction until the health risks are well understood and there is adequate informed consent.

1. Ballantyne, A. & de Lacey, S. 2008. Wanted—egg donors for research: a research ethics approach to donor recruitment and compensation. *International Journal of Feminist Approaches to Bioethics*. 1(2):145-164. [Link](#)
2. Lahl, J. (Producer) Baird, J. & Lahl, J. (Directors). 2011. *Eggsploitation*. Center for Bioethics and Culture. [Link](#) (50 minutes)
3. Stein, A. L. 2011. The conundrum of oocyte donation, human research, OHSS, and ethics. *The American Journal of Bioethics: AJOB*. 11(9): 35-37. [Link](#)
4. Matter of Feminists Choosing Life of N.Y. Inc. v Empire State Stem Cell Board. June 16, 2011. [Link](#)
5. Darnovsky, M. & Fogel, B. Sept 3, 2013. California Controversy: Let’s Not Expand the Women’s Market in Women’s Eggs. *Huffington Post.com*. (1 pg) [Link](#)
6. Crowley, C. 2009. Abortion foes challenge pay for egg donors. *Timesunion.com* [Link](#)

2. Father Berg (Theologian, Former member of NYSTEM Ethics)

Father Berg is a Professor of Moral Philosophy at St. Joseph's Seminary, a Roman Catholic Priest, who as the Executive Director of the Westchester Center of Ethics and the Human Person published "Human Embryo Adoption." Berg also has a Blog "[With Good Reason](#)" and served as a member on the NYSTEM Ethics Committee. He neither supports compensation for oocyte provision nor cybrid generation, and generally supports the moral status of the embryo. His understanding of SCR is rich and textured and he cites a research study by Kramer as evidence for his arguments. He has also written about [cybrids and chimeras](#).

1. Berg, T. June 2, 2009. Scrambled Ethics: embryonic-stem-cell research exploits donors, too. *National Review Online*. [Link](#)
2. Kramer, et al. 2009. US oocyte donors: A retrospective study of medical and psychosocial issues. *Human Reproduction*. 24(12):3144-3149. [Link](#)
3. Zimmer, C. March 22, 2017. A New Form of Stem-Cell Engineering Raises Ethical Questions *New York Times*. A20. [Link](#)
4. Aach, J. et al. March 21, 2017. Addressing the ethical issues raised by synthetic human entities with embryo-like features. *eLife*. 6: e20674. [Link](#)
5. Kwon, D. June 2017. Synthetic stem cells. *The Scientist*: 25. [Link](#)
6. Luo, L., et al. 2017. Fabrication of synthetic mesenchymal stem cells for the treatment of acute myocardial infarction in mice novelty and significance. *Circulation Research*. 120(11):1768. [Link](#)

3. Calla Papademas (Alumna and Oocyte Provider from Stanford U)

Calla Papademas is a Stanford alumna and survivor of health problems related to egg provision for reproductive purposes. At the age of 21 she was recruited for egg provision. She shared her story at the "Trading on Female Body" conference on November 2007. The health-related problems include meningitis, stroke, migraine, nausea, paralysis, and infertility. Though she is an oocyte provider with bad experiences, her perspective is that oocyte provision is a gift and should be altruistic. She is chiefly concerned with long-term follow-up and health risks. Others who see oocyte provision as non-altruistic do not share her opinion. Calla's case is often used by activist groups fighting for regulation and oversight of oocyte provision or a ban altogether.

1. CBC Network. 2007. Calla Papademas' Story. *Vimeo*. (13:51 min) [Link](#)
2. Durrell, J. 2010. Women's eggs: Exceptional endings. *Hastings Women's Law Journal*:187-222. NOTE PAGES. [Link](#)
3. Hamilton, J. 2000. What Are the Costs? *Stanford Magazine*. [Link](#)
4. [Egg Donor's Project](#)
5. Papadimos, T. & Papadimos, A. 2004. The student and the ovum: the lack of autonomy and informed consent in trading genes for tuition. *Reproductive Biology and Endocrinology*. 2(1):56 (6 pages). [Link](#)
6. Levine, A. 2010. Self-regulation, compensation, and the ethical recruitment of oocyte donors. *Hastings Center Report*. 40:25-36. [Link](#)

4. Robert Klitzman (Psychiatrist and Bioethicist/NYSTEM)

Robert Klitzman is a NYSTEM Ethics Committee Member. He co-founded and for five years co-directed the Columbia University Center for Bioethics, and is currently the Director of the Ethics, Policy and Human Rights Core of the HIV Center, and a member of the Division of Psychiatry, Law and Ethics at Columbia. He recently authored a paper in support of compensation for oocyte provision. In Klitzman and Sauer's article they describe oocyte providers as human research subjects because there is no long-term data on health risks, however, he supports payment for oocyte provision for stem cell research within the context of socially just practices. The model consent form for oocyte provision for NYSTEM is discussed in the article by Roxland and informed by Klitzman's research on oocyte providers understanding of health risks associated with provision.

1. NYSTEM. Ethics Committee biographies. NYSTEM. <http://stemcell.ny.gov/ethics-committee>. Accessed July 9, 2013.
2. Klitzman, R. & Sauer, M. 2009. Payment of egg donors in stem cell research in the USA. *Reproductive BioMedicine Online*. 18(5):603-608. [Link](#)

3. Roxland, B. 2012. New York State's landmark policies on oversight and compensation for egg donation to stem cell research. *Regenerative Medicine*. 7(3):397-408. [Link](#)

5. Brooke Ellison (Public Policy, Person Living with a Disability, NYSTEM)

Brooke Ellison, is an advocate for stem cell research and was a former NYSTEM Ethics Committee member and is the Director of Education and Ethics at the Stony Brook University Stem Cell Research Facility Center. In 1990, at the age of 11, she was in an accident that left her paralyzed from the neck down and dependent on a ventilator to breathe. She graduated from Harvard's Kennedy School of Government in 2004. In 2002, she published an autobiography, "Miracles Happen", which was later made into a movie directed by Christopher Reeve. Ms. Ellison was a candidate for New York State Senate in 2006, focusing on the need for New York to embrace funding for stem cell research. In July 2007, she formed a non-profit organization, The Brooke Ellison Project, to educate and mobilize on behalf of the research. She has produced a documentary to provide necessary information on stem cell research titled "Hope Deferred" and published a paper in the *American Journal of Bioethics* arguing for compensation for oocyte provision for stem cell research and argued against oocyte procurement in 2011. Her paper published in 2011 on risk argues that occupational hazards accompany all kinds of work and people have "choice" to participate in the workforce; the paper elicited several responses in this special issue.

1. Ellison, B., & Meliker, J. 2011. Assessing the risk of ovarian hyperstimulation syndrome in egg donation: Implications for human embryonic stem cell research. *The American Journal of Bioethics*. 11(9):22-30. [Link](#)
2. Roxland, B. 2012. New York State's landmark policies on oversight and compensation for egg donation to stem cell research. *Regenerative Medicine*. 7(3):397-408. [Link](#)
3. NYSTEM. Ethics Committee biographies. NYSTEM. [Link](#)

6. Lisa Ikemoto (Lawyer and Social Justice Scholar)

Lisa C. Ikemoto teaches bioethics, health care law, public health law, reproductive rights, law & policy, and marital property. Her research areas include reproductive and genetic technology uses, health care disparities, and public health law. More specifically, she focuses on the ways that race and gender mediate access to and impacts of biomedical technology use and health care and contextualizes her work within the context of labor. Her recent work addresses reproductive tourism, the ways in which human eggs links the fertility and biotechnology industries, and the privatizing effects of informed consent. Dr. Ikemoto is a Bioethics Associate of the U.C. Davis Health System Bioethics Program, and a Faculty Associate of the U.C. Davis Center for Science and Innovation Studies. Working with the Center for Genetics and Society she was active in the fight against the Bonilla Bill in California seeking compensation for oocyte provision

1. Ikemoto, L. March 19, 2015. "High IQ Eggs Wanted"- Ads Appeal to Ego and Altruism, offer \$10,000. *Biopolitical Times*. [Link](#)
2. Ikemoto, L. 2009. Eggs as capital: human egg procurement in the fertility industry and the stem cell research enterprise. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*. 34:763-782. [Link](#)

7. Ruha Benjamin (Sociologist/Race Scholar)

A graduate of Spelman College in anthropology Ruha received her PhD in sociology from UC Berkeley in 2008 and completed a postdoctoral fellowship at UCLA's Center for Society and Genetics in 2010. She is an assistant professor of American Studies at Princeton where her research interests span science, race, medicine, biotechnology, public health and critical social theory. She recently published a book titled *People's Science: Bodies and Rights on the Stem Cell Frontier*, which eloquently describes how society can support equity and innovation and critically analyzed the establishment and operation of the California Institute for Regenerative Medicine (CIRM), and some of this work regarding diversity is captured in the *Sociology Compass* article. Her TEDx talk provides a case study on oocyte provision. She also has a [twitter](#) feed.

1. Benjamin, R. 2015. From park bench to lab bench- what kind of future are we designing? TEDxBaltimore. (21:25 min). VIDEO [Link](#)
2. Benjamin, R. 2014. Race for cures: Rethinking the racial logics of 'trust' in biomedicine. *Sociology Compass*. 8(6): 755-769. [Link](#)
3. Benjamin, R. 2013. Which comes first: the woman or her eggs? *Huffington Post*. [Link](#)

4. Optional: Landecker, H. 1999. Between beneficence and chattel: The human biological in law and science. *Science in Context*. 12 (1):203-225. [Link](#)

8. Erica Haimes (Sociologist and Emerging Technologies Scholar)

Dr. Haimes is a professor of Sociology and Executive Director of the Policy, Ethics, and Life Sciences (PEALS) Research Centre at Newcastle University. She is also a co-author on the International Society for Stem Cell Research (ISSCR) Position Statement on compensation for oocyte provision for stem cell research. Her research has involved ethnographic studies revealing the perspectives of egg sharers; people who share a portion of their eggs with research or others in exchange for lowered costs of IVF treatment for themselves. She has also conducted comparative studies of egg sharing schemes internationally including South Korea, China, and Israel.

1. Haimes, E. et al. 2012. Eggs, ethics and exploitation? Investigating women's experiences of an egg sharing scheme. *Sociology of Health & Illness*. 34(8):1199-1214. [Link](#)
2. Haimes, E. et al. 2013. ISSCR: Committee Forum. Position statement on the provision and procurement of human eggs for stem cell research. *Cell Stem Cell*. 12 (3):285-291. [Link](#)
3. *Optional*: Roberts, C., & Throsby, K. 2008. Paid to share: IVF patients, eggs and stem cell research. *Social Science & Medicine*. 66(1):159-169. [Link](#)

9. Charis Thompson (Feminist Scholar and Science Technology Studies Scholar)

Charis Thompson is Professor of Gender & Women's Studies, and the Associate Director of the Science, Technology, and Society Center at UC Berkeley where she leads the Gender and Science project. She read Philosophy, Psychology, and Physiology at Oxford University, and obtained a Ph.D. from the Science Studies program at UC San Diego. Before coming to Berkeley, she taught in the Science and Technology Studies Department at Cornell University, at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, and in the History of Science Department at Harvard University. She is the author *Good Science: The Ethical Choreography of Stem Cell Research* in which she proposes a strong ethical framework to support emerging biotechnologies within the context of a public social good. She has also authored an article in support of compensation for oocyte provision for stem cell research providing a three-tiered argument and she is interested in addressing health disparities and the plight of the marginalized in society

1. Thompson, C. 2007. Why we should, in fact, pay for egg donation. *Regenerative Medicine*. 2 (2):203-209. [Link](#)
2. Haimes, E. et al. 2013. ISSCR: Committee Forum. Position statement on the provision and procurement of human eggs for stem cell research. *Cell Stem Cell*. 12 (3):285-291. [Link](#)
3. Winikoff, D. Oct 2, 2014. Interview with Charis Thompson. *Talking Biopolitics*. VIDEO [Link](#)

10. Michal Nahman (Sociologist/Feminist Scholar)

Dr. Michal Nahman is a professor of Sociology at the University of the West of England. Nahman's research interests range from militarized nationalism, transnationalism, gender, and reproduction to the politics of academic writing. She recently published a qualitative research paper on the experience of women participating in the Romanian oocyte industry driven by politics in Israel, and a book [Extractions: An Ethnography of Reproductive Tourism](#) examining the cross border egg trade and the expansion of biocapital.

1. Nahman, M. 2008. Nodes of desire: Romanian egg sellers, 'dignity' and feminist alliances in transnational ova exchanges. *European Journal of Women's Studies*. 15(2):65-82. [Link](#)
2. Nahman, M. 2011. Reverse traffic: Intersecting inequalities in human egg donation. *Reproductive Biomedicine Online*. 23(5):626-633. [Link](#)

11. Seema Mohapatra (Public Health Law Scholar)

Dr. Mohapatra is a professor of law whose work spans reproductive justice, surrogacy, and health inequity. She is particularly interested in incentivizing altruistic donations of bodily goods in an effort to diversity of stem cell banks. In her paper she discusses how the court decision in

Flynn v. Holder sets the stage for payments for bodily tissues from those with unique genetic backgrounds for immunocompatibility. She does not take a specific stand on oocyte compensation but bring a larger view toward diversifying banks and compensating people for tissues and cells.

1. Mohapatra, S. Fall 2013. Cutting the Cord from Private Cord Blood Banking: Encouraging Compensation for Public Cord Blood Donations. *University of Colorado Law Review* 84 (4):933-983. [Link](#) and [Link](#) (the last section focuses on proposals to diversify stem cell supply 976-983)
2. Video on Cord Blood Banking: Australian Stem Cell Centre. How Can They Be Used? Cord Blood Banking. Stem Cell Channel. [Link](#)
3. Kurtzberg, J. et al. 2005. Untying the Gordian knot: policies, practices, and ethical issues related to banking of umbilical cord blood. *Journal of Clinical Investigation*. 115(10):2592-2597. [Link](#)

12. Son Bong Hee of Womenlink Korea (Feminist Activist)

Son Bong Hee is a member of Womenlink Korea one of 35 women's organizations to bring a lawsuit against Dr. Hwang of South Korea. Korean Womenlink is an organization established in 1987 to promote gender equality and participatory democratic society. Korean WomenLink's takes a two-pronged approach to its work: advocating for specific policies and challenging inequitable social structures and was active in promoting The Seoul Declaration of the Human Rights of Women and Biotechnology and the Guideline for the Extraction and Offering of Human Eggs. In 2004, Dr. Hwang claimed to have derived pluripotent embryonic stem cells from cloned blastocysts and in 2005, published that he had procured 11 patient specific embryonic lines via SCNT, which would mean these could be used for therapy because patients wouldn't have immune rejection. However, it was revealed that much of this work was fabricated and that the eggs were obtained through payment and/or coercion of junior lab-workers. Furthermore, the reported numbers of eggs used and actual eggs used is dramatically different. i.e. claimed 427, actual 2061.

1. Conference Paper from Leem, S. Y. & Park, J. H. 2008. Rethinking women and their bodies in the age of biotechnology: feminist commentaries on the Hwang affair. *East Asian Science, Technology, and Society: An International Journal*. 2(1):9-26. [Link](#)
2. Peterson, M. J. 2009. Recruitment of egg donors by South Korean cell researchers: case summary. *In International Dimensions of Ethics Education in Science and Engineering: Case Study Series*. UMass. [Link](#)
3. Genetic Crossroads. October 20, 2006. After the Hwang Scandal: Korean Women's Groups Hold International Conference. *Center for Genetics and Society*. [Link](#)

OR

Dr. Diane Beeson (Sociologist/ Feminist/Hands Off Our Ovaries)

Diane Beeson is a distinguished professor whose main research interest for nearly three decades is the social challenges of new reproductive technologies. In 2004 she co-founded the ProChoice Alliance Against California's Proposition 71 (Stem Cell Research Initiative). She is also executive Committee Member of Hands Off Our Ovaries a pro-life and pro-choice feminist organization calling for a moratorium on egg extraction until the health risks are well understood and there is adequate informed consent. Lastly, she reviewed a book about oocyte compensation that targets young girls.

1. [Hands Off Our Ovaries](#)
2. Beeson, D. 2009. Review of "Egg donation: the reasons and the risks." Alliance for Humane Biotechnology. [Link](#)
3. Shalev, C. & Werner-Felmayer, G. 2012. Patterns of globalized reproduction: egg cells regulation in Israel and Austria. *Israel Journal of Health Policy Research*. 1:15 (12 pages) [Link](#)
4. Darnovsky, M. & Fogel, B. Sept 3, 2013. California Controversy: Let's Not Expand the Women's Market in Women's Eggs. *Huffington Post.com*. (1 pg) [Link](#)

OR

SAMA Representative. (Feminist Activist). [SAMA](#) has taken a leadership role in South Asia to promote legislation that would protect women's rights and health in the context of assisted reproductive technologies and industries

1. Cussins, J. Oct 2012. Changes for India's ART policy? *Biopolitical Times*. [Link](#)
2. Luk, J. & Petrozza, J. 2008. Evaluation of compliance and range of fees among American Society for Reproductive Medicine-listed egg donor and surrogacy agencies. *The Journal of Reproductive Medicine*. 53(11):847-52. [Link](#)
3. Darnovsky, M. & Fogel, B. Sept 3, 2013. California Controversy: Let's Not Expand the Women's Market in Women's Eggs. *Huffington Post.com*. (1 pg) [Link](#)

OR

Ingrid Schneider Member of Reprokult (Feminist Activist)

Dr. Ingrid Schneider is a member of Women's Forum on Reproductive Medicine. Reprokult, founded 1999, a nation-wide network composed of women from the social and natural sciences, politicians, and women from professional organizations involved with women's health and counseling centers (midwives, gynecologists, psychologists, social workers), activist groups, and the media. The Women's Forum supports the current German ban on PGD, embryo research, and cloning, and strongly opposes any weakening of the current legal restrictions. Reprokult tries to raise awareness of the social implications of new medical technologies, especially for women, and criticizes narrow, embryocentric discourses. In November 2001 Reprokult attended the "Reproductive Medicine and Genetic Engineering – Women between Self Determination and New Social Norms" conference.

1. Gender and Justice In the Gene Age. Ingrid Schneider. [Link](#)
2. Krawiec, K. January 2014. Egg-donor price fixing and Kamakahi v. American Society for Reproductive Medicine. *AMA Journal of Ethics*. 16 (1): 57-62. [Link](#)
3. Luk, J. & Petrozza, J. 2008. Evaluation of compliance and range of fees among American Society for Reproductive Medicine-listed egg donor and surrogacy agencies. *The Journal of Reproductive Medicine*. 53(11):847-52. [Link](#)

13. Patricia Berne (Disability and Immigrant Activist, Center for Genetics and Society)

Patricia Berne is a former member of the Center for Genetics and Society (CGS), a non-profit based in California that promotes the responsible and ethical use of new biotechnologies, and a person living with infantile progressive spinal muscular atrophy. At CGS Berne worked with disability rights organizations to bring awareness to new reproductive technologies including PGD. As a member of CGS, Berne also was vocally against prop 71, the bill in California that promotes the use of stem cell research with three billion dollars in public funding over ten years. Within the complex stance against Prop 71, Berne rejects the use of people living with disabilities as poster children for stem cell research because it preserves an ideology of people with disabilities as less than and in need of charity. Berne describes "charitable scripts" on page 66 of the book *People's Science* by Ruha Benjamin. Berne also co-founded a theater group called Sins Invalid, which is an artistic group that focuses on disability justice through performance art.

1. Scherman, E. Spring 2009. The speech that didn't fly: Polysemic readings of Christopher Reeve's speech to the 1996 Democratic National Convention. *Disability Studies Quarterly*. 29(2): (10 pages). [Link](#)
2. Benjamin, R. 2013. Chapter 2 *In People's Science: Bodies and Rights On The Stem Cell Frontier* (pp.65) Stanford University Press.
3. Angyal, C. September 19, 2009. The Feministing Five: Patty Berne. [Feministing.com](#).
4. Generations Ahead. March 29-31 A Disability Rights Analysis of Genetic Technologies. Report on the Convening of Disability Rights Leaders. Chicago, Illinois. 17 pages. [Link](#)

14. Kevin Eggan (Scientist Private funded by NYSCF)

Dr. Kevin Eggan is the Chief Scientific Officer at NYSCF and Associate Professor of Stem Cell and Regenerative Biology at Howard Hughes Medical Institute. As a young investigator in the burgeoning field of stem cell biology, Dr. Eggan has garnered international recognition for his seminal work and a number of high profile awards for his creativity and productivity, including the MacArthur Foundation “Genius Grant” in 2006. His current research focuses on applying the knowledge gained in stem cell biology to studying the mechanisms underlying amyotrophic lateral sclerosis (ALS) and discovering new therapeutic targets. He made a significant impact in the field by publishing two high profile papers *in Cell Stem Cell* and *Science* in 2008. In 2009, he was selected as one of 50 Howard Hughes Medical Institute Early Career Scientists. He has used this support to advance the use of both human embryonic stem cells and iPS cells in the study of ALS study and the development of new treatments.

1. Harvard Stem Cell Institute. Kevin C. Eggan, PhD Bio-Sketch. [Harvard Link](#).
2. Modern Healthcare. March 23, 2011. Stop-and-go scenario. *ModernHealthcare.com* [Link](#)
3. Egli, D., et al. 2011. Impracticality of egg donor recruitment in the absence of compensation. *Cell Stem Cell*. 9(4): 293-294. [Link](#)
4. Haimes, E. et al. 2013. ISSCR: Committee Forum. Position statement on the provision and procurement of human eggs for stem cell research. *Cell Stem Cell*. 12 (3):285-291. [Link](#)

OR

Dieter Egli (Scientist Private funded by NYSCF)

Dieter Egli's research in the NYSCF laboratory currently focuses on the generation of therapeutically relevant cells for diabetes. His work has relevance for the use of stem cells to study disease, screen for new drugs, and cell replacement therapy. His research creating patient-specific stem cells using the DNA of patients with type 1 diabetes, first published in *Nature* in October 2011, was named the #1 Medical Breakthrough of 2011 by *TIME* magazine, which also named him one of 2011's People Who Mattered. Dr. Egli earned his PhD at the University of Zurich, Switzerland. He received his postdoctoral training in the laboratory of Kevin Eggan at the Department of Stem Cell and Regenerative Biology, Harvard University, studying reprogramming after nuclear transfer. Dr. Egli is also an Adjunct Associate Research Scientist in the Division of Molecular Genetics, Department of Pediatrics, Columbia University, and has a collaborative relationship with Columbia's Naomi Berrie Diabetes Center. In an unusual step, a scientific research article published in 2012 dedicates three paragraphs in the introduction to the oocyte procurement protocol. Egli has also authored a paper advising of the impracticality of altruistic donation.

1. Modern Healthcare. March 23, 2011. Stop-and-go scenario. *ModernHealthcare.com* [Link](#)
2. Park, A. 2011. Dr. Dieter Egli - *TIME*'s People Who Mattered in 2011. *TIME.com*. [Link](#)
4. Egli, D., et al. 2011. Impracticality of egg donor recruitment in the absence of compensation. *Cell Stem Cell*. 9(4): 293-294. [Link](#)
5. Haimes, E. et al. 2013. ISSCR: Committee Forum. Position statement on the provision and procurement of human eggs for stem cell research. *Cell Stem Cell*. 12 (3):285-291. [Link](#)

15. Dori Woods (Northeastern University) or Jonathan Tilly (Vincent Center for Reproductive Biology: Ovarian Stem Cell Lab)

Dori Woods is an assistant professor of reproductive biology at Northeastern University. As a post doctoral researcher in the lab of Jonathon Tilly, at Mass General in Boston she identified the existence of ovarian stem cells that could potentially address the need for fresh oocytes while minimizing the number of people with ovaries subjected to hormone stimulation and ovarian surgery. Research groups doing this work span academia, medicine and biotechnology, as well as several countries including Japan, China, and the United States. Some of this work has come under fire by other researchers who claim the work is not reproducible or weak in proving that ovarian stem cells exist and this includes Lovell-Badge.

1. Dolgin, E. (Director). Feb 26, 2012. Stem cell discovery puts women's reproduction on fertile ground. *NatureVideo*. *Spoonful of Medicine*. Produced by Erin Olsen, narrated by Rebecca Hersher, and animation and artwork by Katherine Vacari. MacMillan Publishers. [Link](#)
2. Lovell-Badge, R. March 12, 2012. Hype, hope and heresy – or why it is bad to eggsaggerate. *BioNews.org*. [Link](#)
3. Woods, D. and Tilly J. 2013. Isolation, characterization and propagation of mitotically active germ cells from adult mouse and human ovaries. *Nature Protocols*. 8: 968-88. [Link](#)

4. Couzin-Frankel, J. Nov 6, 2015. Eggs unlimited. *Science*. 350(6261):620-624. [Link](#)

16. Robin Lovell-Badge (Stem cell scientist UK public funding)

Robin Lovell-Badge the head of the Stem Cell Biology and Developmental Genetics group at the MRC National Institute for Medical Research in London. He challenges the work of Jonathan Tilly and Dori Woods and demands a more robust address of the scientific methods and also cautions the hype around the work. Lovell-Badge argues that the Tilly research study lacks validity and ultimately there is not enough evidence of ovarian stem cells.

1. Eurostemcell. Robin Lovell-Badge Group. [Link](#)

2. Lovell-Badge, R. March 12, 2012. Hype, hope and heresy – or why it is bad to eggsaggerate. *BioNews.org*. [Link](#)

3. Dolgin, E. (Director). Feb 26, 2012. Stem cell discovery puts women's reproduction on fertile ground. NatureVideo. *Spoonful of Medicine*. Produced by Erin Olsen, narrated by Rebecca Hersher, and animation and artwork by Katherine Vacari. MacMillan Publishers. [Link](#)

4. Woods, D. and Tilly J. 2013. Isolation, characterization and propagation of mitotically active germ cells from adult mouse and human ovaries. *Nature Protocols*. 8: 968-88. [Link](#)

5. Couzin-Frankel, J. Nov 6, 2015. Eggs unlimited. *Science*. 350(6261):620-624. [Link](#)

17. ASRM Ethics Committee Member (Professional Society)

The American Society for Reproductive Medicine has a committee to address ethical issues surrounding reproductive technology. In 2009, the committee issued a revision to its report on the use of extranumerary embryos for stem cell research. ASRM and its sister professional organization SART both aim to provide cutting edge information concerning the practice of ART. The committee publishes a number of reports that can be found here and one of the most recent focuses on lesbian and gay and single women access to ART.

1. American Society for Reproductive Medicine. 1999-2013. Ethics Committee Documents: ethical considerations of assisted reproductive technologies. *ASRM*. [Link](#)

2. Ethics Committee of the American Society for Reproductive Medicine. 2013. Disposition of abandoned embryos: A committee opinion. *Fertility and Sterility*. 99 (7): 1848-1849. [Link](#)

3. Ethics Committee of the American Society for Reproductive Medicine. 2013. Donating embryos for human embryonic for stem cell research (hESCR): A committee opinion. *Fertility and Sterility*. 100 (4): 935-939. [Link](#)

18. Chelsea Briganti (Designer)

Chelsea Briganti a graduate of Parsons School for Design at The New School proposed a product design to provide people with an inexpensive and accessible means by which to procure, transport, and store menstrual blood stem cells in public stem cell banks to counter the commercialization of such a service by Cryo-Cell. Her proposed project Mademoicell challenges gendered depictions of menstruation.

1. Rowland, T. 2009. Stem Cells Discovered in Menstrual Blood: Endometrial Regenerative Stem Cells. [Link](#)

2. Briganti, C. 2010. Madamoicell Design Process Video/ Menstrual Blood Stem Cells. *Stem Cells Across the Curriculum*. [Link](#)

3. Labarre, S. May 18, 2010. Almost Genius: The Once-A-Month Stem-Cell Collector for Ladies. *Fast Company.com*. [Link](#)

4. Khoury, M. et al. 2014. The promising potential of menstrual stem cells for antenatal diagnosis and cell therapy. *Frontiers of Immunology*. 5 (Article 205): 1-8. [Link](#)

5. Faramarzi, H. et al. Jan 2016. The potential of menstrual blood-derived stem cells in differentiation to epidermal lineage: A preliminary report. *World Journal of Plastic Surgery*. 5 (1): 26-31. [Link](#)

19. Gabrielle Werner-Felmayer (Scientist/Bioethicist)

Dr. Werner-Felmayer is a distinguished professor of Biological Chemistry at the Medical University of Innsbruck in Austria. Her main research interest crosses biochemistry and bioethics in the context of new technologies (genetics, stem cell research, reproductive medicine). She also

serves on the 17-member executive committee representing different research universities within the International Network Institutions for Medical Ethics Education (NIMED), UNESCO chair in Bioethics. This Committee has focused on curricula development for postgraduate training programs and on organizing events at the intersection between academia and the public. She is the co-author of an integrative paper that compares the procurement and use of human eggs in two countries and calls for efforts of harmonization with regard to policy and commercialization. These two countries were chosen because they represent two extremes: Israel has a liberal ART policy to some extent, while Austria holds restrictive policies. The call for harmonization prompted commentary by [Franciose Shenfield](#) in the *BioNews Blog*.

1. Shalev, C. & Werner-Felmayer, G. 2012. Patterns of globalized reproduction: Egg cells regulation in Israel and Austria. *Israel Journal of Health Policy Research*. 1:15. (11 pages) [Link](#)
2. Shenfield, F. 2012. Giving oocytes to women in need: permitted, forbidden, or pressured? A commentary. *Israel Journal of Health Policy Research*. 1(1):1-2. [Link](#)

20. Francoise Shenfield (Fertility Specialist) is a fertility specialist qualified in medical law and ethics with more than 25 years of experience at the University College London Hospitals. She is a member of the European Society of Human Reproduction and Embryology's Taskforce for Ethics and Law, and is a co-chair of the International Federation of Gynecology and Obstetrics' ethics committee. She wrote a commentary in response to the call to action for harmonization by Werner-Felmayer. In this response she states, "we advise that it is essential to follow the recommendations of the EU Tissues Directive, with special regard to the screening process and the non-commercialization conditions." countries were chosen because they represent two extremes: Israel has a liberal ART policy to some extent, while Austria holds restrictive policies. The call for harmonization prompted commentary by [Franciose Shenfield](#) in the *BioNews Blog*.

1. Shalev, C. & Werner-Felmayer, G. 2012. Patterns of globalized reproduction: egg cells regulation in Israel and Austria. *Israel Journal of Health Policy Research*. 1:15. (11 pages) [Link](#)
2. Shenfield, F. 2012. Giving oocytes to women in need: permitted, forbidden, or pressured? A commentary. *Israel Journal of Health Policy Research*. 1(1):1-2. [Link](#)

21. Michelle Goodwin (Health Law) is on the faculty in the law and public health schools at UC Irvine, and also holds an appointment in the Gender & Sexuality Studies Program. She is also the founding Director of the Center for Biotechnology and Global Health and serves on the Board of Directors for the American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU). She has written three books and over seventy articles regarding social justice issues concerning bodily goods and reproductive labor, with a specific focus on illegal markets for organs. She is a blogger for the Harvard Bill of Health.

1. Trotter, J. 2006. Book Review: Black Markets: The Supply and Demand of Body Parts. *NEJM*.355:1183-84. [Link](#)
2. Goodwin, M. 2007. The body market. Race politics & private ordering. *Arizona Law Review*. 49(599). Minnesota Legal Studies Research Paper No. 38. (39 pages) [Link](#)
3. Video. Goodwin, M. 2011. Whose Values and Principles in a New Biopolitics. Tarrytown Meetings. Youtube. (10:48 min) [Link](#)
4. Goodwin, M. Oct 18, 2014. How Facebook and Apple's Egg-Freezing Policies Hurt Working Women. *Alternet*. [Link](#)

Invited but unable to attend

22.. Rene Almeling (Feminist)

Rene Almeling is a feminist scholar and associate professor of sociology at Yale University. Her research interests include gender, markets, medicine, and genetics. She received a B.A. in Gender Studies and Religious Studies from Rice University in 1998 and a Ph.D. in Sociology from UCLA in 2008. From 2008 to 2010, she was a Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Scholar in Health Policy Research at the University of California, Berkeley. Currently, she is doing research on genetic testing, genetic counseling, and *in vitro* fertilization. She has published the book *Sex Cells: Medical Markets for Egg and Sperm* and *Selling Genes, Selling Gender Egg Agencies, Sperm Banks, and The Medical Market for Genetic Material*. [Link](#)

23. Kristi Jones

Kristi Jones is a clinical geneticist and consultant for Genea, one of the leaders in fertility treatment, for people considering pre-implantation genetic diagnosis or other genetic diagnosis issues as a result from the IVF process. She was trained from The University of Sydney in 1990 with a PhD in clinical genetics, and also has a background in pediatrics. Therefore, her knowledge of genetic conditions encompasses both children and adults. She also has a special interest in community education, presenting regularly to parent/family and community groups, both in and out of the hospital setting. [Link](#)

24. George Church

George Church is Professor of Genetics at Harvard Medical School who is also a futurist, committed to extending human longevity and quality of life. He is also the cofounder of PersonalGenomes.org. He believes that science should proceed in an unfettered manner to promote innovation, and synthetic DNA and organisms, including SHEEFs, synthetic embryo like beings to support embryonic stem cell research. His extensive knowledge of genetics, bioengineering, stem cell research, and diagnostics place him in a unique position to advance scientific discovery. [Link](#)