

Oocytes & Blood: Gifts & Commodities Position Paper Rubric

Remember to view the prompts/questions in the Case study Assignment

		Developing	Proficient	Exemplary
Position on Oocyte Provision for Embryonic Stem Cell Research Supported by Public Funding <i>What do you propose? What are the alternatives?</i> <i>What should accompany funding proposals?</i> <i>Health registry, recruitment guidelines, compensation, ban, caps, etc.</i>	5	Position and perspective unclear	Position and perspective is clear	Clear position and perspective; relative to other stakeholders
Evidence: Social Values-some examples are provided <i>How do policies and practices pose risk or benefit to society? What does society value and how is this represented in approaches based on altruism, compensation, or payment? Whose lives are valued by your policy (Embryos, oocyte provider, person living with disability, etc).</i> <i>How does society weigh investments in economic capital v. social capital? Who should be able to make decisions (nation, state, individual)? Who will have access to participation, therapies, and policy making/</i>	10	Very little address of societal values, and lack of clarity regarding distributive justice and participatory justice	Addresses what society values and the ways this aligns with the distribution of benefits, risks and trade-offs in society	Provides concrete evidence and examples of how particular practices reflect social values and the distribution of benefits, risks, and trade-offs, and relating this to distributive and participatory justice issues
Evidence: Science <i>How do policies and practices related to different types of stem cells (ASCs, ESCs, iPSCs) pose risk or benefit to scientific research and /or biomedicine?</i> <i>How can policy influence the quality and quantity of the stem cell lines with respect to differentiation and regenerative potential? Which biological characteristics of the egg are proving important for stem cell research? Why does genetic diversity of downstream stem cells depend on policies of oocyte provision?</i> <i>What do we know about the science of oocyte maturation and removal?</i>	10	Assumes value in pursuing ASCR and/or ESCR but does not detail the risks, benefits, and trade offs involved in providing biological resources for these areas of research.	Compares ESCR and ASCR but does not clarify risk or benefit to society if one or the other was not pursued to advance science or biomedicine; inadequate address of diversity in stem cells/banks.	Compares the scientific and therapeutic potential of ESCR and ASCR and clarifies the benefits, risks, and trade offs for society if either or both are pursued. Addresses genetic diversity in private and public stem cell lines and banks and explains the connection to participatory and distributive justice.

<p>Evidence Policy: Policy & Activism</p> <p><i>Trajectory of past and present policies and movements designed to guide Assisted Reproductive Technologies, Stem Cell Research, Tissue Donation/Sale/Exchange that can both promote research and protect oocyte providers</i></p>	10	Mention of legislation, policies, reports, or activist movements, but impact is not entirely clear	Some mention of laws, executive orders, lawsuits, or regulatory bodies, regarding bodily tissues and stem cell research, but little address of efforts to challenge those that are in place and some lack of connection or cross talk among them	Mention of multiple laws, specific policies, executive orders, and lawsuits by name and connects this back to social values; refers to the organization, bodies, groups that regulate biospecimen provision, stem cell research, and health research and the connections among them and those that challenge the status quo as well as why they are being passed or challenged.
<p>Informed Consent & Ethics</p> <p><i>What are the challenges of obtaining informed consent in a changing landscape? What policies are in place to address dual use, the use of oocytes or extranumerary embryos collected for diagnosis/treatment of disease/syndrome related to reproduction and then used in research? What needs to be in place for information to be gathered and provided during an informed consent process?</i></p>	10	Mentions informed consent in the research and clinical setting, but does not elaborate on the challenges associated with the process	Discusses informed consent in the context of securing biomaterials for stem cell research and in the testing of stem cell related therapies	Discusses the challenges in acquiring informed consent in the context of gathering biomaterials for stem cell research and the testing of stem cell related therapies in relation to risk–benefit decision making.
<p>Health</p> <p><i>What are the risks and benefits of investing in the biomedical and/or social models of public health? What are some risks to the oocyte provider; transplant recipient, etc.? How does your policy address individuals living with disability? How does the diversity of cell lines produced using your policy address the diversity in populations?</i></p>	10	Addresses health risks for the oocyte provider, and egg sharers, but does not address the specifics of vulnerable populations, and does not address genetic diversity of stem cell lines	Addresses health risks for oocyte providers, egg sharers, and those receiving therapies derived from SCR. Addresses the kinds of disability and disease best suited for SCR related approaches, and some mention of vulnerable groups.	Addresses health risks for oocyte providers, egg sharers, and those receiving therapies derived from SCR. Addresses the kinds of disability and disease best suited for SCR related approaches and how they relate to allocations for funding and study design within the context of participatory and distributive justice.

Counter Argument: Risks & Benefits <i>Who benefits and who carries burden or risk?</i> <i>What are some legal or historical precedents?</i>	15	Acknowledges opposition	Presents specific opposition to stance; provides some evidence and example for opposition	Presents specific opposition to stance; provides concrete evidence and example of the opposing viewpoint
Rebuttal Risks & Benefits <i>Who benefits and who carries burden or risk?</i> <i>What are some legal or historical precedents?</i>	15	Does not address opposing viewpoint or arguments	Argues against one specific opposition with some evidence and example	Provides concrete evidence and examples to argue against the opposing viewpoint
Writing Style: Academic Argumentative Essay	10	Writing/flow of ideas needs improvement; grammatical/spelling errors.	Writing is clear & focused; flow of argument could be improved; no grammatical/spelling errors	Writing is clear, engaging, with good flow of theme and logic. No grammatical or spelling errors
Citations & Bibliography: At LEAST FIVE citations to course resources should be cited and included in the bibliography	5	Few references and/or citation errors.	Bibliography draws from case resources & correct citations	Rich bibliography drawing from many course resources & correct citations.